

GUIDELINES FOR THE EVALUATION OF VETERINARY SERVICES

APPENDIX XXX

(From International OIE Code, 2002)

A P P E N D I X X . X . X .

**GUIDELINES FOR THE EVALUATION OF
VETERINARY SERVICES**

INTRODUCTION

1. Evaluation of Veterinary Services is an important element in the risk analysis process which countries may legitimately use in their policy formulations directly applying to animal health and sanitary controls of international trade in animals, animal-derived products, animal genetic material and animal feedstuffs.

Any evaluation should be carried out with due regard for Chapter 1.3.3. of the *International Animal Health Code*.

2. In order to ensure that objectivity is maximised in the evaluation process, it is essential for some standards of discipline to be applied. The OIE has developed guidelines which can be practically applied to the evaluation of Veterinary Services. These are relevant for evaluation of the Veterinary Services of one country by those of another country for the purposes of risk analysis in international trade. The guidelines are also applicable for evaluation by a country of its own Veterinary Services – the process known as self-evaluation or self-assessment– and for periodic re-evaluation. This document is intended to cover all of these purposes.

In carrying out a risk analysis prior to deciding the sanitary/zoosanitary conditions for the importation of a commodity, an importing country is justified in regarding its evaluation of the Veterinary Services of the exporting country as critical.

WHAT IS MEANT BY EVALUATION OF VETERINARY SERVICES?

3. The purpose of evaluation may be either to assist a national authority in the decision-making process regarding priorities to be given to its own Veterinary Services (self-evaluation) or to assist the process of risk analysis in international trade in animals and animal-derived products to which official sanitary and/or zoosanitary controls apply.
4. In both situations, the evaluation should demonstrate that the Veterinary Services have the capability for effective control of the sanitary and zoosanitary status of animals and animal products. Key elements to be covered in this process include resource adequacy, management capability, legislative and administrative infrastructures, independence in the exercise of official functions and performance history, including disease reporting.
5. Competence and integrity are qualities on which others base their confidence in individuals or organisations. Mutual confidence between relevant official Veterinary Services of trading partner countries contributes fundamentally to stability in international trade in animals and animal-related products. In this situation, scrutiny is directed more at the exporting country than at the importing country.
6. Although quantitative data can be provided on Veterinary Services, the ultimate evaluation will be essentially qualitative. While it is appropriate to evaluate resources and infrastructure (organisational, administrative and legislative), it is also appropriate to place emphasis on the evaluation of the quality of outputs and performance of Veterinary Services. Evaluation should take into consideration any formally-based quality systems used by Veterinary Services. [The relative importance given to the quality of outputs and performance in the evaluation process should be determined on a bilaterally-agreed basis.]

7. An importing country has a right of assurance that information on sanitary/zoosanitary situations provided by the Veterinary Services of an exporting country is objective, meaningful and correct. Furthermore, the Veterinary Services of the importing country are entitled to expect validity in the veterinary certification of export.
8. An exporting country is entitled to expect that its animals and animal products will receive reasonable and valid treatment when they are subjected to import inspection in the country of destination. The country should also be able to expect that any evaluation of its standards and performance will be conducted on a non-discriminatory basis. The importing country should be prepared and able to defend any position which it takes as a consequence of the evaluation.

SCOPE

9. In the evaluation of Veterinary Services, the following items may be considered, depending on the purpose of the evaluation:
 - organisation and structure of the Veterinary Services
 - human resources
 - material (including financial) resources
 - functional capabilities and legislative support
 - animal health and veterinary public health controls
 - formal quality systems including quality policy
 - performance assessment and audit programmes
 - participation in OIE activities and compliance with OIE Member Countries' obligations.

Attached to the document is a model questionnaire which could be used for the following objectives:

- self-evaluation by national Veterinary Services which perceive a need to prepare information for national or international purposes
- evaluation by a prospective or actual importing country of the Veterinary Services of a prospective or actual exporting country
- verification or re-verification of an evaluation in the course of a visit to the exporting country by the importing country.

EVALUATION CRITERIA

ORGANISATION AND STRUCTURE OF THE VETERINARY SERVICES

10. A key element in the evaluation is the study of the organisation and structure of the official Veterinary Services. The Veterinary Services should define and set out their policy, objectives and commitment to quality systems and standards. These organisational and policy statements should be described in detail. Organisational charts and details of functional responsibilities of staff should be available for evaluation. The role and

responsibility of the Chief Veterinary Officer/Veterinary Director should be clearly defined. Lines of command should also be described.

Appendix V (contd)

11. The organisational structure should also clearly set out the interface relationships of government Ministers and departmental Authorities with the Chief Veterinary Officer/Veterinary Director and the Veterinary Services. Formal relationships with statutory authorities and with industry organisations and associations should also be described. It is recognised that Services may be subject to changes in structure from time to time. Major changes should be notified to trading partners so that the effects of re-structuring may be assessed. organisational structure
12. Organisational components of Veterinary Services which have responsibility for key functional capabilities should be identified. These capabilities include epidemiological surveillance, disease control, import controls, animal disease reporting systems, animal identification systems, traceability systems, animal movement control systems, communication of epidemiological information, and inspection and certification. Laboratory and field systems and their organisational relationships should be described. import
13. To reinforce the reliability and credibility of their services, the Veterinary Services may have set up quality systems that correspond with their fields of activity and to the nature and scale of activities that they carry out. Evaluation of such systems should be as objective as possible.

Veterinary Administrations

14. The Veterinary Administration of a country is defined in Chapter 1.1.1. of the *International Animal Health Code*. The Veterinary Administration alone speaks for the country as far as official international dialogue is concerned. This is also particularly important to cases where zoning and regionalisation are being applied. The responsibilities of the national Veterinary Administration and all Veterinary Authorities in that country should be made clear in the process of evaluation of Veterinary Services.

Veterinary Authorities

15. A Veterinary Authority is defined in Chapter 1.1.1. of the *International Animal Health Code*. As some countries have some official veterinary authority roles vested in autonomous sub-national (state/provincial, municipal) government bodies there is an important need to assess the role and function of these Services. Details of their roles, relationship (legal and administrative) to each other and to the national Veterinary Services should be available for evaluation. Annual reports, review findings and access to other information pertinent to the animal health activities of such bodies should also be available.

Other providers of services to Veterinary Services

16. Similarly, where the national Veterinary Services have arrangements with other providers of relevant services such as universities, laboratories, information services, etc., these arrangements should also be described. For the purposes of evaluation, it is appropriate to expect that the quality of organisational and functional standards which apply to Veterinary Services should also apply to the services of these other providers.

QUALITY SYSTEMS

17. The Veterinary Services should demonstrate a commitment to the quality of the processes and outputs of their services. Where services or components of services are delivered under a formal quality systems programme which is based on OIE recommended standards or, especially in the case of laboratory components of veterinary services other internationally recognised quality standards, the Veterinary Services undergoing evaluation should make available evidence of accreditation, details of the documented quality processes and documented outcomes of all relevant audits undertaken.
18. Where the Veterinary Services undergoing evaluation make large use of formal quality systems in the delivery of their services, it is appropriate that greater emphasis be placed on the outcomes of evaluation of these quality systems than on the resource and infrastructural components of the services.

HUMAN RESOURCES

19. The Veterinary Services should demonstrate that their human resource component includes an integral core of full-time civil service employees. This core must include graduate veterinarians. It should also include other qualified professional officers, administrative officials and technical support staff. This does not exclude the possibility of employing, in addition, part-time veterinary and para-veterinary staff and private sector veterinarians. It is essential that all the above categories of staff be subject to legal disciplinary provisions. Data relating to the resource base of the Veterinary Services undergoing evaluation should be available.

Role of the human resources

20. In addition to raw quantitative data on this resource base, the functions of the various categories of staff in the Veterinary Services should be described in detail. This is necessary for analysis and estimation of the appropriateness of the application of qualified skills to the tasks undertaken by the Veterinary Services and may be relevant, for example, to the roles of veterinary and animal health technical assistants in field services. In this case, the evaluation should provide assurances that disease monitoring is being conducted by a sufficient number of qualified, experienced field veterinarians who are directly involved in farm visits; there should not be an over-reliance on technical assistant staff for this task.
21. Analysis of these data can be used to estimate the potential of the Veterinary Services to have reliable knowledge of the state of animal health in the country and to support an optimal level of animal disease control programmes. A large population of private practitioners would not provide the Veterinary Services with an effective epizootiological information base without legislative (e.g. compulsory reporting of notifiable diseases) and administrative (e.g. official animal health surveillance and reporting systems) mechanisms in place. *infectious*
22. These data should be assessed in close conjunction with the other information described in this document. For example, a large field staff (veterinarians and animal health technical assistants) need fixed, mobile and budgetary resources for animal health activities in the livestock farming territory of the country. If deficiencies are evident, there would be reason to challenge the validity of epizootiological information. *infectious?*

MATERIAL RESOURCES

Financial

23. Actual yearly budgetary information regarding the Veterinary Services should be available and should include the details set out in the model questionnaire. Information is required on conditions of service for veterinary staff (including salaries and incentives) and should provide a comparison with the private sector and perhaps with other professionals. Information should also be available on non-government sources of revenue available to veterinarians in their official responsibilities.

Administrative

Accommodation

24. The Veterinary Services should be accommodated in premises suitable for efficient performance of their functions. The component parts of the Veterinary Services should be located as closely as possible to each other at the central level, and in the regions where they are represented, in order to facilitate efficient internal communication and function.

Communications

25. The Veterinary Services should be able to demonstrate that they have reliable access to effective communications systems, especially for animal health surveillance and control programmes. Inadequate communications systems within the field services components of these programmes or between outlying offices and headquarters, or between the Veterinary Services and other relevant administrative and professional services, signify an inherent weakness in these programmes. Adequate communications systems between laboratories and between field and laboratory components of the Veterinary Services should also be demonstrated.
26. Examples of types of communications which should be routinely available on an adequate country-wide basis are national postal, freight and telephone networks. Rapid courier services, facsimile and electronic data interchange systems (e.g. e-mail and internet services) are examples of useful communication services which, if available, can supplement or replace the others. A means for rapid international communication should be available to the national Veterinary Services, to permit reporting of changes in national disease status consistent with OIE recommendations and to allow bilateral contact on urgent matters with counterpart Services in trading-partner countries.

Transport Systems

27. The availability of sufficient reliable transport facilities is essential for the performance of many functions of Veterinary Services. This applies particularly to the field services components of animal health activities (e.g. emergency response visits). Otherwise, the Veterinary Services cannot assure counterpart services in other countries that they are in control of the animal health situation within the country.
28. Appropriate means of transport are also vital for the satisfactory receipt of samples to be tested at veterinary laboratories, for inspection of imports and exports, and for the

performance of animal and animal product inspection in outlying production or processing establishments.

Technical

29. Details available on laboratories should include resources data, programmes under way as well as those recently completed and review reports on the role or functions of the laboratory. Information as described in the model questionnaire should be used in the evaluation of laboratory services.

Cold chain for laboratory samples and veterinary medicines

30. Adequate refrigeration and freezing systems should be available and should be used throughout the country to provide suitable low temperature protection for laboratory samples in transit or awaiting analysis, as well as veterinary medical products (e.g. vaccines) when these are required for use in animal disease control programmes. If these assurances cannot be given, it may be valid to discount many types of test results, as well as the effectiveness of certain disease control programmes and the export inspection system in the country undergoing evaluation.

Diagnostic laboratories

31. Analysis of the laboratory service component of Veterinary Services, which would include official governmental laboratories and other laboratories accredited by the Veterinary Services for specified purposes, is an essential element of the evaluation process. The quality of the veterinary diagnostic laboratories of a country underpins the whole control and certification processes of the zoosanitary/sanitary status of exported animals and animal products, and therefore these laboratories should be subject to rigid quality assurance procedures and should use international quality assurance programmes (wherever available) for standardising test methodologies and testing proficiency. An example is the use of International Standard Sera for standardising reagents.
32. This emphasis is valid whether one relates it to the actual testing performed on individual export consignments or to the more broad and ongoing testing regimes which are used to determine the animal health and veterinary public health profiles of the country and to support its disease control programmes. For the purposes of evaluation, veterinary diagnostic laboratories include those which are concerned with either animal health or veterinary public health activities.

Research [laboratories]

33. The scope of animal disease and veterinary public health problems in the country concerned, the stages reached in the controls which address those problems and their relative importance can be measured to some degree by analysis of information on [the] government [research facilities (where such facilities exist) including the extent of] priorities and programmes for research in animal health. This information should be accessible for evaluation purposes.

FUNCTIONAL CAPABILITIES AND LEGISLATIVE SUPPORT

Animal health and veterinary public health

34. The Veterinary Services should be able to demonstrate that they have the capacity, supported by appropriate legislation, to exercise control over all animal health matters. These controls should include, where appropriate, compulsory notification of prescribed animal diseases, inspection, movement controls, quarantine of infected premises/areas, testing, treatment, destruction of infected animals or contaminated materials, controls over the use of veterinary medicines, etc. The scope of the legislative controls should include domestic animals and their reproductive material, animal products, wildlife as it relates to the transmission of diseases to domestic animals, and other products subject to veterinary

22-12-01

inspection. Arrangements should exist for co-operation with the veterinary authorities of the neighbouring countries for the control of animal diseases in border areas. Information on the veterinary public health legislation covering the production of products of animal origin for national consumption may be also considered in the evaluation.

Export/import inspection

35. National Veterinary Services should have appropriate legislation and adequate capabilities to prescribe the methods for control and to exercise systematic control over the import and export processes of animals and animal products in so far as this control relates to sanitary and zoosanitary matters. The evaluation should also involve the consideration of [relevant legislation and] administrative instructions to ensure the enforcement of importing country requirements during the pre-export period.
36. In the context of production for export of foodstuffs of animal origin, the Veterinary Services should demonstrate that comprehensive legislative provisions are available for the oversight by the relevant authorities of the hygienic process and to support official inspection systems of these commodities which function to standards consistent with or equivalent to relevant Codex Alimentarius and OIE standards.
37. Control systems should be in place which permit the exporting veterinary authorities to approve export premises. The Veterinary Services should also be able to conduct testing and treatment as well as to exercise controls over the movement, handling and storage of exports and to make inspections at any stage of the export process. The product scope of this export legislation should include, *inter alia*, animals and animal products (including animal semen, ova and embryos), and animal feedstuffs.
38. The national Veterinary Services should be able to demonstrate that they have adequate capabilities and legislative support for zoosanitary control of imports and transit of animals, animal products and other materials which may introduce animal diseases. This could be necessary to support claims by the Veterinary Services that the animal health status of the country is suitably stable, and that cross-contamination of exports from imports of unknown or less favourable zoosanitary status is unlikely. The same considerations should apply in respect of veterinary control of public health. The Veterinary Services should be able to demonstrate that there is no conflict of interest when certifying veterinarians are performing official duties.

Documentation control

39. Legislation should also provide the right to deny and/or withdraw official certification. Penalty provisions applying to malpractice on the part of certifying officials should be included.
40. The Veterinary Services should demonstrate that they are capable of providing accurate and valid certification for exports of animals and animal products. They should have appropriately organised procedures which ensure that sanitary/animal health certificates are issued by efficient and secure methods. The documentation control system should be able to correlate reliably the certification details with the relevant export consignments and with any inspections to which the consignments were subjected.
41. Security in the export certification process, including electronic documentation transfer, is important. A system of independent compliance review is desirable, to safeguard against fraud in certification by officials and by private individuals or corporations. The certifying veterinarian should have no [financial] conflict of interest in the commercial aspects of the animal or product being certified and [should not be in the direct employment of the owner of the animal or product] be independent from the commercial parties.

ANIMAL HEALTH CONTROLS

Animal health status

42. An updated assessment of the present animal disease status of a country is an important and necessary procedure. For this undertaking, studies of the OIE publications such as *World Animal Health*, the *Bulletin* and *Disease Information* must be fundamental reference points. The evaluation should consider the recent history of the compliance of the country with its obligations regarding international notification of animal diseases. In the case of an OIE Member Country, failure to provide the necessary animal health reports consistent with OIE requirements will detract from the overall outcome of the evaluation of the country.
43. An exporting country should be able to provide further, detailed elaboration of any elements of its animal disease status as reported to the OIE. This additional information will have particular importance in the case of animal diseases which are foreign to or strictly controlled in the importing country or region. The ability of the Veterinary Services to substantiate elements of their animal disease status reports with surveillance data, results of monitoring programmes and details of disease history is highly relevant to the evaluation. In the case of evaluation of the Veterinary Services of an exporting country for international trade purposes, an importing country should be able to demonstrate the reasonableness of its request and expectations in this process.

Animal health control

44. Details of current animal disease control programmes should be considered in the evaluation. These programmes would include epidemiological surveillance, official government-administered or officially-endorsed, industry-administered control or eradication programmes for specific diseases or disease complexes, and animal disease emergency preparedness. Details should include programme plans, incidence and prevalence data, resource commitments, interim results and programme review reports.

National animal disease reporting systems

45. The presence of a functional animal disease reporting system which covers all agricultural regions of the country and all veterinary administrative control areas should be demonstrated.
46. An acceptable variation would be the application of this principle to specific zones of the country. In this case also, the animal disease reporting system should cover each of these zones. Other factors should come to bear on this situation, e.g. the ability to satisfy trading partners that sound animal health controls exist to prevent the introduction of disease or export products from regions of lesser veterinary control.

VETERINARY PUBLIC HEALTH CONTROLS

Food hygiene

47. The national Veterinary Services should be able to demonstrate effective responsibility for the veterinary public health programmes relating to the production and processing of animal products, especially for export. If the national Veterinary Services do not exercise responsibility over these programmes, the evaluation should include a comprehensive review of the role and relationship of the organisations (national, state/provincial, and municipal) which are involved. In such a case, the evaluation should consider whether the national Veterinary Services can provide guarantees of responsibility for and effective

control of the sanitary status of animal products prior to export, especially meat and meat products throughout the slaughter, processing, transport and storage periods.

Zoonoses

48. Within the structure of Veterinary Services, there should be appropriately qualified staff whose responsibilities include the monitoring and control of zoonotic diseases and, where appropriate, liaison with medical authorities.

Chemical residue testing programmes

49. Adequacy of controls over chemical residues in exported animals, animal products and feedstuffs should be demonstrated. Statistically-based surveillance and monitoring programmes for environmental and other chemical contaminants in animals, in animal-derived foodstuffs and in animal feedstuffs should be favourably noted. These programmes should be coordinated nationwide. Correlated results should be freely available on request to existing and prospective trading partner countries. Analytical methods and result reporting should be consistent with internationally recognised standards. If official responsibility for these programmes does not rest with the Veterinary Services, they should provide appropriate help to obtain the relevant information for assessment.

Veterinary medicines

50. It should be acknowledged that primary control over veterinary medicinal products may not rest with the veterinary authorities in some countries, owing to differences between governments in the division of legislative responsibilities. However, for the purpose of evaluation, the Veterinary Services should be able to demonstrate the existence of effective controls (including nationwide consistency of application) over the registration, supply and use of veterinary medicines, biologicals and diagnostic reagents. The control of veterinary medicines has direct relevance to the areas of animal health and public health.
51. In the animal health sphere, this has particular application to biological products. Inadequate controls on the registration and use of biological products leave the Veterinary Services open to challenge over the quality of animal disease control programmes and over safeguards against animal disease introduction in imported veterinary biological products.
52. It is valid, for evaluation purposes, to seek assurances of effective government controls over veterinary medicines in so far as these relate to the public health risks associated with residues of these chemicals in animals and animal-derived foodstuffs. This process should be consistent with the standards set by the Codex Alimentarius or with alternative requirements set by the importing country where the latter are scientifically justified.

Integration between animal health control and veterinary public health

53. The existence of any organised programme which incorporates a structured system of information feedback from inspection in fresh meat or dairy product establishments and applies this in animal health control should be favourably noted. Such programmes should be integrated within a national epizootiological surveillance scheme.
54. Veterinary Services which direct a significant element of their animal health programmes specifically towards minimising microbial and chemical contamination of animal-derived products in the human food chain should receive favourable recognition in the evaluation. There should be evident linkage between these programmes and the official control of veterinary medicines and relevant agricultural chemicals.

PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT AND AUDIT PROGRAMMES

Strategic plans

55. The objectives and priorities of the Veterinary Services can be well evaluated if there is a published official strategic plan which is regularly updated. Understanding of functional activities is enhanced if an operational plan is maintained within the context of the strategic plan. The strategic and operational plans, if these exist, should be included in the evaluation.
56. Veterinary Services which use strategic and operational plans may be better able to demonstrate effective management than countries without such plans.

Performance assessment

57. If a strategic plan is used, it is desirable to have a process which allows the organisation to assess its own performance against its objectives. Performance indicators and the outcomes of any review to measure achievements against pre-determined performance indicators should be available for evaluation. The results should be considered in the evaluation process.

Compliance

58. Matters which can adversely affect a favourable evaluation include instances of inaccurate or misleading official certification, evidence of fraud, corruption, or interference by higher political levels in international veterinary certification.
59. It is desirable that the Veterinary Services contain (or have a formal linkage with) an independent internal unit/section/commission the function of which is to critically scrutinise their operations. The aim of this unit should be to ensure consistent and high integrity in the work of the individual officials in the Veterinary Services and of the corporate body itself. The existence of such a body can be important to the establishment of international confidence in the Veterinary Services.
60. An important feature when demonstrating the integrity of the Veterinary Services is their ability to take corrective action when miscertification, fraud or corruption has occurred.
61. A supplementary or an alternative process for setting performance standards and application of monitoring and audit is the implementation of formal quality systems to some or all activities for which the Veterinary Services are responsible. Formal accreditation which is to international quality system standards should be utilised if recognition in the evaluation process is to be sought in accordance with the guide "General requirements with which a veterinary service must conform to be recognised at international level as competent and reliable for the inspection and certification of animals and animal products" provided by the OIE.

Veterinary Services administration

Annual reports

62. Official government annual reports should be published, which provide information on the organisation and structure, budget, activities and contemporary performance of the

Veterinary Services. Current and retrospective copies of such reports should be available to counterpart Services in other countries, especially trade partners.

Appendix V (contd)

Reports of government review bodies

63. The reports of any periodic or ad hoc government reviews of Veterinary Services or of particular functions or roles of the Veterinary Services should be considered in the evaluation process. Details of action taken as a consequence of the review should also be accessible.

Reports of special committees of enquiry or independent review bodies

64. Recent reports on the Veterinary Services or elements of their role or function, and details of any subsequent implementation of recommendations contained in these reports should be available. The Veterinary Services concerned should recognise that the provision of such information need not be detrimental to the evaluation outcome; in fact, it may demonstrate evidence of an effective audit and response programme. The supplying of such information can reinforce a commitment to transparency.

In-service training and development programme for staff

65. In order to maintain a progressive approach to meeting the needs and challenges of the changing domestic and international role of Veterinary Services, the national administration should have in place an organised programme which provides [relevant] appropriate training across a range of subjects for [graduate] relevant staff [and middle-ranking and senior administrative officials]. This programme should include participation in scientific meetings of animal health organisations. Such a programme should be used in assessing the effectiveness of the Services.

Publications

66. Veterinary Services can augment their reputation by demonstrating that their staff publish scientific articles in refereed veterinary journals or other publications.

Formal linkages with sources of independent scientific expertise

67. Details of formal consultation or advisory mechanisms in place and operating between the Veterinary Services and local and international universities, scientific institutions or recognised veterinary organisations should be taken into consideration. These could serve to enhance the international recognition of the Veterinary Services.

Trade performance history

68. In the evaluation of the Veterinary Services of a country, it is pertinent to examine the recent history of their performance and integrity in trade dealings with other countries. Sources of such historical data may include Customs Services.

PARTICIPATION IN OIE ACTIVITIES

69. The questions of the adherence of a country to the OIE and to the recommendations of the OIE *International Animal Health Code* are relevant to an evaluation of the Veterinary Services of the country. Self-acknowledged inability or repeated failure of a Member Country to fulfil reporting obligations to the OIE will detract from the overall outcome of the evaluation. Such countries, as well as non-member countries, will need to provide extensive information regarding their Veterinary Services and sanitary/zoosanitary status for evaluation purposes.

CONCLUSION

70. The Veterinary Services of a country may undertake self-evaluation against the above criteria for such purposes as national interest, improvement of internal efficiency or export trade facilitation. The way in which the results of self-evaluation are used or distributed is a matter for the country concerned.
71. A prospective importing country may undertake an evaluation of the Veterinary Services of an exporting country as part of a risk analysis process, which is necessary to determine the sanitary or zoosanitary measures which the country will use to protect human or animal life or health from disease or pest threats posed by imports. Periodic evaluation reviews are also valid following the commencement of trade.
72. In the case of evaluation for the purposes of international trade, the authorities of an importing country should use the principles elaborated above as the basis for the evaluation and should attempt to acquire information according to the model questionnaire. The Veterinary Services of the importing country are responsible for the analysis of details and for determining the outcome of the evaluation after taking into account all the relevant information. The relative ranking of importance ascribed, in the evaluation, to the criteria described in this document will necessarily vary according to case-by-case circumstances. This ranking should be established in an objective and justifiable way. Analysis of the information obtained in the course of an evaluation study must be performed in as objective a manner as possible. The validity of the information should be established and reasonableness should be employed in its application. The assessing country must be willing to defend any position taken on the basis of this type of information, if challenged by the other party.

*

* *

Appendix 1

MODEL QUESTIONNAIRE

**Information requirements for self-evaluation/evaluation/verification
of Veterinary Services**

NATIONAL VETERINARY SERVICES OF

(country)

A. Organisation and structure of Veterinary Services

1. *National Veterinary Services*

Organisational chart including numbers, positions and numbers of vacancies.

2. *Sub-national Veterinary Services*

Organisational charts including numbers [and], positions and number of vacancies.

3. *Other providers of Veterinary Services*

Description of any linkage with other providers of Veterinary Services.

B. Human and material resources

1. *National data on human resources*

1.1. *Veterinarians*

a) Total numbers of:

- veterinarians registered in the country who are graduates from internationally recognised veterinary schools which are registered accordingly in the WHO/FAO World Directory of Veterinary Schools
- graduate veterinarians not included above.

b) Numbers of:

- full time government veterinarians:
 - . national
 - . sub-national
- part time government veterinarians:
 - . national
 - . sub-national
- private veterinarians authorised by the Veterinary Services to perform official veterinary functions [*Describe accreditation standards, responsibilities and/or limitations applying to these private veterinarians*].

c) Animal health

- Numbers associated with farm livestock sector on a majority time basis in a veterinary capacity, by geographical area [*Show categories and numbers to differentiate staff involved in field service, laboratory, administration, import/export and other functions, as applicable*]:
 - full time government veterinarians:
 - ± national
 - ± sub-national
 - part time government veterinarians:
 - ± national
 - ± sub-national
 - privately-employed veterinarians.
 - [. veterinarians in national government service
 - . veterinarians in sub-national government service.]

d) Veterinary public health

- Numbers employed in food inspection on a majority time basis, by commodity [*Show categories and numbers to differentiate staff involved in inspection, laboratory and other functions, as applicable*]:
 - full time government veterinarians:
 - ± national
 - ± sub-national
 - part time government veterinarians:
 - ± national
 - ± sub-national
 - privately-employed veterinarians.
 - [. veterinarians in national government service
 - . veterinarians in sub-national government service.]

e) Numbers of veterinarians relative to certain national indices:

- per total human population
- per farm livestock population, by geographical area
- per livestock-farming unit, by geographical area.

f) Veterinary education

- number of veterinary schools
- length of veterinary course (years)
- international recognition of veterinary degree.

Appendix V (contd)

1.2. *Graduate staff (non-veterinarian)*

CATEGORY	Within national Veterinary Services	Available to national Veterinary Services
- biologists		
- biometricians		
- economists		
- engineers		
- lawyers		
- other science graduates		
- others		

1.3. *Technical assistants employed by the Veterinary Services*

a) Animal health

- Numbers involved with farm livestock on a majority time basis:
 - . by geographical area
 - . proportional to numbers of field Veterinary Officers in the Veterinary Services, by geographical area
- Education details.

b) Veterinary public health

- Numbers in food inspection on a majority time basis:
 - . meat inspection:
 - export meat establishments with an export function
 - domestic meat establishments (no export function)
 - . dairy inspection
 - . other foods
- Numbers in import/export inspection
- Education details.

1.4. *Support staff*

- Numbers directly available to Veterinary Services:
 - . administration
 - . communication
 - . transport.

1.5. *Descriptive summary of the functions of the various categories of staff mentioned above*

1.6. *Additional information and/or comments*

2. *Financial management information from the Veterinary Services which should be considered in the assessment procedure*

a) Total budgetary allocations to the Veterinary Services for the current and past two fiscal years:

- for the national Veterinary Services
- for each of any sub-national veterinary authorities
- for other relevant government-funded institutions.

b) Sources of the budgetary allocations and amount:

- government budget
- sub-national authorities
- taxes and fines
- grants
- private services.

c) Proportional allocations of the amounts in a) above for operational activities and for the programme components of Veterinary Services.

d) Total allocation proportionate of national public sector budget [*This data may be necessary for comparative assessment with other countries which should take into account the contexts of the importance of the livestock sector to the national economy and of the animal health status of the country*].

e) Actual and proportional contribution of animal production to gross domestic product.

3. *Administration details for consideration in the assessment*

3.1. *Accommodation*

Summary of the numbers and distribution of official administrative centres of the Veterinary Services (national and sub-national) in the country.

3.2. *Communications*

Summary of the forms of communication systems available to the Veterinary Services on a nation-wide and local area bases.

3.3. *Transport*

- Itemised numbers of types of functional transport available on a full-time basis for the Veterinary Services. In addition provide details of transport means available part-time

Details of annual funds available for maintenance and replacement of motor vehicles.

4. *Laboratory services*

4.1. *Diagnostic laboratories (laboratories engaged primarily in diagnosis)*

- Descriptive summary of the organisational structure and role of the government veterinary laboratory service in particular its relevance to the field Veterinary Services
- Numbers of veterinary diagnostic laboratories operating in the country
 - . government operated laboratories
 - . private laboratories accredited by government for the purposes of supporting official or officially-endorsed animal health control or public health testing and monitoring programmes and import/export testing
- Descriptive summary of accreditation procedures and standards for private laboratories
- Human and financial resources allocated to the government veterinary laboratories, including staff numbers, graduate and post-graduate qualifications and opportunities for further training
- List of diagnostic methodologies available against major diseases of farm livestock (including poultry)
- Details of collaboration with external laboratories including international reference laboratories and details on numbers of samples submitted
- Details of quality control and assessment (or validation) programmes operating within the veterinary laboratory service
- Recent published reports of the official veterinary laboratory service which should include details of specimens received and foreign animal disease investigations made
- Details of procedures for storage and retrieval of information on specimen submission and results
- Reports of independent reviews of the laboratory service conducted by government or private organisations (if available)
- Strategic and operational plans for the official veterinary laboratory service (if available).

4.2. *Research laboratories (laboratories engaged primarily in research)*

- Numbers of veterinary research laboratories operating in the country
 - . government operated laboratories
 - . private laboratories involved in full time research directly related to animal health and veterinary public health matters involving production animal species

- Summary of human and financial resources allocated by government to veterinary research
- Published programmes of future government sponsored veterinary research
- Annual reports of the government research laboratories.

C. Functional capabilities and legislative support

1. *Animal health and veterinary public health*

Assessment of the adequacy and implementation of relevant legislation (national or sub-national) concerning the following:

- animal and veterinary public health controls at national frontiers
- control of endemic animal diseases [of livestock], including zoonoses
- [- control of zoonotic diseases]
- emergency powers for control of exotic disease outbreaks
- [- compensation provisions for animal owners affected by disease control measures]
- [- fish disease control]
- inspection and registration of facilities
- veterinary public health controls of the production, processing, storage and marketing of meat for domestic consumption
- veterinary public health controls of the production, processing, storage and marketing of fish, dairy products and other foods of animal origin for domestic consumption
- registration and use of veterinary pharmaceutical products including vaccines.

Assessment of ability of Veterinary Services to enforce legislation.

2. *Export/import inspection*

Assessment of the adequacy and implementation of relevant national legislation concerning:

- veterinary public health controls of the production, processing, storage and transportation of meat for export
- veterinary public health controls of production, processing, storage and marketing of fish, dairy products and other foods of animal origin for export
- animal health and veterinary public health controls of the export and import of animals, animal genetic material, animal products, animal feedstuffs and other products subject to veterinary inspection
- animal health controls of the importation, use and bio-containment of organisms which are aetiological agents of animal diseases, and of pathological material
- animal health controls of importation of veterinary biological products including vaccines
- administrative powers available to Veterinary Services for inspection and registration of facilities for veterinary control purposes (if not included under other legislation mentioned above)
- documentation and compliance.

Assessment of ability of Veterinary Services to enforce legislation.

D. Animal health and veterinary public health controls

1. *Animal health*

Description of and sample reference data from any national animal disease reporting system controlled and operated or coordinated by the Veterinary Services.

Description of and sample reference data from other national animal disease reporting systems controlled and operated by other organisations which make data and results available to Veterinary Services.

Description and relevant data of current [animal disease] official control programmes [controlled and operated or coordinated by the Veterinary Services] including:

- epidemiological surveillance or monitoring programmes
- officially [endorsed] approved industry-administered control or eradication programmes for specific diseases.

Description and relevant details of animal disease emergency preparedness and response plans.

Recent history of animal disease status:

- animal diseases eradicated nationally or from defined sub-national zones in the last ten years
- animal diseases of which the prevalence has been controlled to a low level in the last ten years
- animal diseases introduced to the country or to previously free sub-national regions in the last ten years
- emerging diseases in the last ten years
- animal diseases of which the prevalence has increased in the last ten years.

2. *Veterinary public health*

2.1. *Food hygiene*

Annual national slaughter statistics for the past three years according to official data

- . bovine
- . ovine
- . porcine
- . caprine
- . poultry
- . equine
- . other.

Estimate of total annual slaughterings which occur but are not recorded under official statistics

Proportion of total national slaughter which occurs in registered export establishments, by category of animal

Proportion of total national slaughter which occurs under veterinary control, by category of animal

Numbers of commercial fresh meat establishments in the country which are registered for export by national Veterinary Services

- . slaughterhouses (indicate species of animals)
- . cutting/packing plants (indicate meat type)

meat processing establishments (indicate meat type)

cold stores.

Numbers of commercial fresh meat establishments in the country approved by other importing countries which operate international assessment inspection programmes associated with approval procedures

Numbers of commercial fresh meat establishments under direct public health control of the Veterinary Services (including details of category and numbers of inspection staff associated with these premises).

Description of the veterinary public health programme related to production and processing of the following animal products for human consumption especially including details applying to exports of these commodities

- . fresh meat
- . poultry meat
- . meat products
- . game meat
- . dairy products
- . fish, fishery products, molluscs and crustaceans
- . other foods of animal origin

Descriptive summary of the roles and relationships of other official organisations in public health programmes for the products listed above if the national Veterinary Services do not have responsibility for those programmes which apply to national production destined to domestic consumption and/or exports of the commodities concerned.

2.2. *Zoonoses*

Descriptive summary of the numbers and functions of staff of the Veterinary Services involved primarily with monitoring and control of zoonotic diseases.

Descriptive summary of the role and relationships of other official organisations involved in monitoring and control of zoonoses to be provided if the national Veterinary Services do not have these responsibilities.

2.3. *Chemical residue testing programmes*

Descriptive summary of national surveillance and monitoring programmes for environmental and chemical residues and contaminants applied to animal-derived foodstuffs, animals and animal feedstuffs.

Role and function in these programmes of the national Veterinary Services and other Veterinary Services to be described in summary form.

Descriptive summary of the analytical methodologies used and their consistency with internationally recognised standards.

2.4. *Veterinary medicines*

Descriptive summary of the administrative and technical controls involving registration, supply and use of veterinary pharmaceutical products especially including biological products. This summary should include a focus on veterinary public health considerations relating to the use of these products in food-producing animals.

Role and function in these programmes of the national Veterinary Services and other Veterinary Services to be described in summary form.

E. Quality Systems

Accreditation

Details and evidence of any current, formal accreditation by external agencies of the Veterinary Services of any components thereof.

Quality manuals

Documented details of the quality manuals and standards which describe the accredited quality systems of the Veterinary Services.

Audit

Details of independent (and internal) audit reports which have been undertaken of the Veterinary Services of components thereof.

F. Performance Assessment and audit programmes

1. *Strategic plans and review*

Descriptive summary and copies of strategic and operational plans of the Veterinary Services organisation.

Descriptive summary of corporate performance assessment programmes which relate to the strategic and operational plans - copies of recent review reports.

2. *Compliance*

Descriptive summary of any compliance unit which monitors the work of the Veterinary Services (or elements thereof).

3. *Annual reports of the national Veterinary Services*

Copies of official annual reports of the national (sub-national) Veterinary Services.

4. *Other reports*

Copies of reports of official reviews into the function or role of the Veterinary Services which have been conducted within the past 3 years.

Descriptive summary (and copy of reports if available) of subsequent action taken on recommendations made in these reviews.

5. **Training**

Descriptive summary of in-service and development programmes provided by the Veterinary Services (or their parent Ministries) for [graduate] relevant staff [and middle-ranking and senior veterinary administrative officials].

Summary descriptions of training courses and duration.

Details of staff numbers (and their function) who participated in these training courses in the last three years.

6. **Publications**

Bibliographical list of scientific publications by staff members of Veterinary Services in the past three years.

7. **Sources of independent scientific expertise**

List of local and international universities, scientific institutions and recognised veterinary organisations with which the Veterinary Services have consultation or advisory mechanisms in place.

G. Membership of the OIE

State if country is a member of the OIE and period of membership.

H. Other assessment criteria

INFORMATION COMPILED BY

(signature)

*

* *

REFERENCES

1. ACHA P.N. (1987). – A strategy for Veterinary Services to meet the requirements of a changing world. *In Organisation of Veterinary Services. Rev. sci. tech. Off. int. Epiz.*, **6** (4), 925-945.
2. BLAJAN L., GEE R.W. & GIMENO E.J. (1987). – Organisation of Veterinary Services for the future. *In Organisation of Veterinary Services. Rev. sci. tech. Off. int. Epiz.*, **6** (4), 899-910.
3. GRIFFITHS R.B. & KÖNIGSHOFER H.O. (1974). – Standard of Veterinary Services. Document MI/H5566. Extract from “Manual on standards of Veterinary Services, meat hygiene and meat inspection, post-mortem judgement of slaughter animals and establishment of specific disease-free zones”. FAO, Rome, 16 pp.
4. HENDERSON W.M. (1986). – Organisation of Veterinary Services. *Rev. sci. tech. Off. int. Epiz.*, **5** (3), 537-551.

Appendix V (contd)

5. HOWE K.S. (1988). – The economics of Veterinary Services: a perspective. *Br. vet. J.*, **144**, 343-350.
6. KING L.J. (1989). – The new politics of animal health policy and programs. *In Proc. 11th International Symposium of the World Association of Veterinary Microbiologists, Immunologists and Specialists in Infectious Diseases. Perugia, Mantova, Italy, 2-6 October. Società Editrice Esculapio, Bologna, 51-54.*
7. ZEILENGA W.A. (1988). – Health certification by accredited veterinarians. *J. Am. vet. med. Assoc.*, **192** (8), 1054-1056.

EVALUATION OF VETERINARY SERVICES

Article 1.3.3.1.

The quality of the *Veterinary Services* depends on a set of factors, which include fundamental principles of an ethical, organisational and technical nature. The *Veterinary Services* shall conform to these fundamental principles, regardless of the political, economic or social situation of their country.

Compliance with these fundamental principles by the *Veterinary Services* of a Member Country is important to the establishment and maintenance of confidence in its *international veterinary certificates* by the *Veterinary Services* of other Member Countries.

Should the responsibility for establishing or applying animal health measures, or issuing *international veterinary certificates* be exercised by an organisation other than the *Veterinary Services*, or by an authority or agency on behalf of the *Veterinary Services*, the same fundamental principles should apply.

These fundamental principles are presented in Article 1.3.3.2. The remaining factors of quality are described in Part 1 of the *Code* (notification, principles of certification, etc.) and the document entitled “Guidelines for the evaluation of Veterinary Services” included in Appendix XXX.

The quality of *Veterinary Services* can be measured through an evaluation, whose general principles are described in Articles 1.3.3.3. and 1.3.3.4.